UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO
FACULTY OF LAW

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 09235028 9

Constitutional Law "C"
Professor L. Weinrib

Faculty of Law, University of Toronto
2012-2013

Volume I

STORAGE

KE
4218.5
.W45
2012
v.1
c.1

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
2012
FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO
FACULTY OF LAW

Constitutional Law "C"
Professor L. Weinrib

Faculty of Law, University of Toronto
2012-2013

Volume I

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/constitutionalla01wein_1

CANADIAN CONSTITUTIONAL LAW: PRECHARTER
L WEINRIB VOL I (2012-2013)

CHAPTER 1: CONSTITUTIONALISM AND CONSTITUTIONAL LAW

John Stuart Mill, *On Liberty* at 3ff 1
Louis Henkin, "Elements of Constitutionalism" 4
Catherine Elliott & Frances Quinn (eds.), *English Legal System* 11
O. Hood Phillips and P. Jackson, "Written and Unwritten Constitutions" 14
"The Crown", *Town Investments Ltd. v. Dept of Environment*, [1978] A.C. 359 15
W.I. Jennings, *The Law and the* Constitution 16

CHAPTER 2: INTRODUCTION TO CANADA'S CONSTITUTION

Re: Resolution to amend the Constitution, [1981] 1 S.C.R. 753 ("the *Patriation Reference*") 18
Reference re: Secession of Québec, [1998] 2 S.C.R. 217 ("the *Secession Reference*") 26
Ref. re: Remuneration of Judges of the Provincial Court of Prince Edward Island, [1997] 3 S.C.R. 3 ("the *Judges Remuneration Reference*") 38

CHAPTER 3: THE QUASI-COLONIAL PERIOD

A. "The Race Cases"

James W. St. G. Walker, "Quong v. The King" 41
Union Colliery Company of British Columbia v. Bryden, [1899] A.C. 580 62
Cunningham and AG BC v. Tomey Homma and Attorney-General Canada, [1903] A.C. 151 64
Quong Wing v. The King, [1914] 49 S.C.R. 440 65
James W. St. G. Walker, "Quong Wing and Quong Sing" 68
Ian Bushnell, "*Reference Re Deportation of Japanese, 1946*" 84
Frank Scott, "The Deportation of the Japanese Canadians: An Open Letter to The Press" 88

B. Economic Regulation

The King v. Eastern Terminal Elevator Co., [1925] S.C.R. 434 90
Vincent MacDonald, "The Privy Council and the Canadian Constitution, [1951] 29 Can. Bar Rev. 1021 at 1124 ff 94

CHAPTER 4: MOVING TOWARDS POLITICAL AND CONSTITUTIONAL INDEPENDENCE: EARLY READINGS OF THE B.N.A. ACT AS A CONSTITUTION

A. Women in Public Life

Reference re Meaning of the Word "Persons" in s. 24 of the B.N.A. Act, [1928] S.C.R. 276 ("the *Persons Case*") 99
Lord Brougham's Act, 1850 ("An Act for shortening the language...) 103
Edwards et al. v. Attorney-General for Canada et al., [1930] A.C. 124 ("the *Persons Case*") 104

B. The Treaty Making Power

In re the Regulation and Control of Aeronautics in Canada, [1932] A.C. 54 108
In re Regulation and Control of Radio Communications in Canada, [1932] A.C. 304 112
Reference re Weekly Rest in Industrial Undertakings Act, Minimum Wages Act and Limitations of Hours Act, [1937] 1 D.L.R. 673 114

C. Interpreting a Written Constitution

Bushnell, "The Privy Council and Mr. Bennett's New Deal Legislation" 116
A.G. Ontario v. A.G. Canada, [1947] A.C. 127 ("the *Supreme Court Act Reference*") 122

CHAPTER 5: "INDIANS AND LANDS RESERVED TO THE INDIANS" (PRE 1982)

The Royal Proclamation of 1763 (excerpt) 125
Constitution Act, 1867 (U.K.), 30 & 31 Vict., c. 3, s. 91(24) 126
Report of The Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples (1996) (excerpt) 127
Ryder, "The Demise and Rise of the Classical Paradigm in Canadian Federalism" 134
Fleras and Elliott, "The Department of Indian Affairs: From Bureaucracy to Empowerment?" 142
Guerin v. The Queen, [1984] 2 SCR 335 145

CHAPTER 6: TRANSITION TO POST-WWII RIGHTS PROTECTION

A. The Implied Bill of Rights: Adjudicating the Template of Liberal Democracy

Bushnell, "The Implied Bill of Rights" 147A
Sandra Djwa, *The Politics of the Imagination: A Life of F.R. Scott* 150
Roncarelli v. Duplessis, [1959] S.C.R. 121 156
Ian Bushnell, Note on *Alberta Statutes Reference* 163
Reference re Alberta Statutes, [1938] S.C.R.100 165
Winner v. S.M.T. (Eastern) Ltd., [1951] S.C.R.887 167
Saumur v. City of Quebec and Attorney-General of Quebec, [1953] 4 D.L.R. 641 169
Switzman v. Elbling and Attorney-General of Quebec, [1957] 7 D.L.R. (2d) 337 173
Attorney-General (Canada) and Dupond v. Montreal, [1978] 2 S.C.R. 770 178

B. The Canadian Bill of Rights: Legislative Supremacy and Rights Protection

Bushnell, "The Canadian Bill of Rights" 180
James G. Snell and Frederick Vaughan, *The Supreme Court of Canada: History of the Institution* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1985) at 218ff 182
The Canadian Bill of Rights, S.C. 1960, c. 44 186
The Queen v. Drybones, [1970] S.C.R. 282 187
Attorney-General of Canada v. Lavell—Isaac v. Bedard, [1974] S.C.R. 1349 190
Bliss v. Attorney-General of Canada, [1979] 1 S.C.R. 183 196

CHAPTER 7: INTRODUCTION TO THE CHARTER

A. The Adoption of the Charter

A. Cairns, *Charter Versus Federalism* 199
P. Russell, "The Political Purposes of the Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms" 202
L. Weinrib, "Canada's Constitutional Revolution: From Legislative to Constitutional State" 205
L. Weinrib, "Canada's Charter of Rights: Paradigm Lost?" 209
L. Weinrib, "The Charter Critics: Strangers in a Strange Land" 226

B. The Legal Framework of the Charter: Rights, Limits & Override

i. Reading the Charter: Purposive Interpretation

Hunter v. Southam, [1984] 2 S.C.R. 145 232
Minister of Home Affairs v. Fisher, [1980] A.C. 319 (P.C.) 236
R. v. Big M Drug Mart, [1985] 1 S.C.R. 295 238

ii. Justified Limits on Rights

R. v. Oakes [1986] 1 S.C.R. 103 241
G. Robbers, *An Introduction to German Law*, 50-2 244
R. Berger, "Some Aspects of Legal Reasoning Concerning Constitutionally Protected Rights" 246

iii. Legislative Override

Lorraine E. Weinrib, "Learning to Live With the Override" 250
Lorraine E. Weinrib, "The Notwithstanding Clause: The Loophole Cementing the Charter" 273
"Alberta Adopts 'Notwithstanding' Referendum Act" 280

CANADIAN CONSTITUTIONAL LAW: THE CHARTER
L WEINRIB VOL II (2012-2013)

CHAPTER 8: DEMOCRATIC RIGHTS (CHARTER S.3-5)

Reference Re Provincial Electoral Boundaries (Sask.) [1991] 2 S.C.R. 158 1
Sauvé v. Canada (Chief Electoral Officer), [1993] 2 S.C.R. 438 7
Notes: *Figueroa v. Canada*, [2003] 1 S.C.R. 912 33

CHAPTER 9: FREEDOM OF CONSCIENCE AND RELIGION (CHARTER S.2(A))

A. Introduction

L Weinrib "Do Justice to Us" 40
Case extracts:
R. v. Big M Drug Mart, [1985] 1 S.C.R. 295 41
Syndicat Northcrest v. Amselem, [2004] 2 S.C.R. 551 42
Note: Freedom of Conscience 43

B. The Demise of the Informal Christian Establishment
i. Public Policy
L Weinrib, "'Do Justice to Us!' Jews and the Constitution of Canada 45
R. v. Big M Drug Mart, [1985] 1 S.C.R. 295 51
Note: *Edwards Books,* [1986] 2 S.C.R. 713 58
L Weinrib, "Ensuring Equality"..... 60
Note: exemptions from performing same-sex marriages 62

ii. The Public School System Transformed by Charter Recognition of Religious/Moral Diversity
Zylberberg v. Sudbury Board of Education (1988) 52 D.L.R. 577 (Ont.C.A.) 64
C.C.L.A. v. Minister of Education (1990)..... 66
Notes:
Ross v. New Brunswick School District No. 15, [1996] 1 S.C.R. 825 69
Trinity Western Univ v. B. C. College of Teachers (2001) S.C.R. 31 69
Chamberlain v. Surrey School District No. 36 [2002] S.C.J. No. 87 70
Kempling v. B. College of Teachers (2005) 255 D.L.R. (4th) 169..... 71
Multani v. Commission scolaire Marguerite-Bourgeoys [2006] 1 S.C.R. 256 73
S.L. v Commission scolaire des Chênes [2012] S.C.J. No. 7..... 78

iii. The Bifurcated Public School System: Arrangements for Diversity at Confederation
Notes:
Reference Re Bill 30, [1987] 1 S.C.R. 1148 84
Adler v. Ontario, [1996] 3 S.C.R. 609..... 84
L Weinrib, "Funding for Faith-based Schools?", Law Times July, 2007 86
Note: *Hall (Litigation guardian of) v. Powers*, (2002) 87

C. Minority Religious Practices
B. (R.) v. Childrens's Aid Society, [1995] 1 S.C.R. 315 (sub nom. Sheena B., Re) 88
A.C. v. Manitoba (Director of Child and Family Services) 2009 SCC 30 92
Alberta v. Hutterian Brethren of Wilson Colony [2009] S.C.J. No. 37.....102
Syndicat Northcrest v. Amselem, [2004] 2 S.C.R. 551 127
Bruker v. Marcovitz, [2007] 3 S.C.R. 607 129
Reference re: Section 293 of the Criminal Code of Canada ("the *Polygamy Reference*")
2011 BCSC 1588.....135

CHAPTER 10: FREEDOM OF EXPRESSION (CHARTER S.2(B))
A. Introduction
R. v. Keegstra, [1990] 3 S.C.R. 697 155
Notes:
The European Convention on Human Rights (1950), extract 159
International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (1966), extract 160

B. Political Expression
Native Women's Assn. of Canada v. Canada, [1994] 3 S.C.R. 627.....161
Note: *Libman v. Quebec (Attorney General)*, [1997] 3 S.C.R. 569.....164
Thomson Newspapers Co. v. Canada (Attorney General), [1998] 1 S.C.R. 877.....165
Note: *Ontario (Attorney General) v. Dieleman,* 1994 A.C.W.S.J. LEXIS 76253; 1994
A.C.W.S.J. 404796; 49 A.C.W.S. (3d) 1059.....180
R.W.D.S.U., Local 558 v. Pepsi-Cola, 2002 Can. Sup. Ct. LEXIS 9; 2002 SCC 8.....183

C. Commercial Speech
Irwin Toy Ltd. v. Quebec (Attorney General), [1989] 1 S.C.R. 927 187
RJR - MacDonald Inc. v. Canada (Attorney General), [1995] 3 S.C.R. 199.....196
Canada (Attorney General) v. JTI-Macdonald Corp, [2007], 2 S.C.R. 610 211
Ramsden v. Peterborough (City), 16 C.R.R. (2d) 240; 1993 C.R.R. LEXIS 90 221
R. v. Guignard, 2002 Can. Sup. Ct. LEXIS 17; 2002 SCC 14 225

D. Hate Speech
R. v. Keegstra, [1990] 3 S.C.R. 697 228
Note on: *R. v. Zundel*, [1992] 2 S.C.R. 731 249

E. Obscenity and Pornography
R. v. Butler, [1992] 1 S.C.R. 452 251
Little Sisters Book and Art Emporium v. Canada (Minister of Justice), [2000] 2 S.C.R. 1120 264
R. v. Sharpe, [2001] 1 S.C.R. 45, 2001 SCC 2 279
Note: The Charter Reconstructs the Indecency Standard – *R v Labaye* ([2005] 3 SCR 728, 2005 SCC 80) and *R v Kouri* ([2005] 3 SCR 789, 2005 SCC 81) 300

F. Defamation
Hill v. Church of Scientology Toronto, [1995] 2 S.C.R. 1130 301

CHAPTER 11: RIGHT TO LIFE, LIBERTY, AND SECURITY OF THE PERSON
A. Introduction and Methodology
Philip W. Augustine, "Protection of the Right to Property" 310
Singh v. Canada (Minister Of Employment And Immigration), [1985] 1 S.C.R.77 313
Re B.C. Motor Vehicle Act (Motor Vehicle Act Reference), [1985] 2 S.C.R. 486 316

B. Life, Liberty, and Security of the Person
R. v. Morgentaler, [1988] 1 S.C.R. 30 322
Rodriguez v. B.C.A.G., [1993] 3 S.C.R. 519 336
B. (R.) v. Children's Aid Society, [1995] 1 S.C.R. 315 (sub nom. Sheena B., Re) 344
New Brunswick B v. G(J.), [1999] 3 S.C.R. 46 350
Reference re ss. 193 and 195.1(1)(c) of the Criminal Code ("the *Prostitution Reference*"), [1990] 1 S.C.R. 1123 357
Note: *Godbout v. Longueuil*, [1997] 3 S.C.R. 844 360

CANADIAN CONSTITUTIONAL LAW
L WEINRIB VOL III (2012-2013)
EQUALITY, MODERN FEDERALISM, ABORIGINAL RIGHTS POST 1982

CHAPTER 12: EQUALITY
A. Introduction
J Snell and F Vaughan, "The Supreme Court of Canada" 1
B.L. Strayer, "In the Beginning: The Origins of s15 of the Charter" 8
Law Society of British Columbia v. Andrews [1989] 1 S.C.R. 143 14

B. Gender
Note: *Symes v. Canada*, [1993] 4 SCR 695 16
Law v. Canada (Minister of Employment and Immigration)[1999] 1 S.C.R. 497 17
Newfoundland (Treasury Board) v. N.A.P.E. [2004] 3 S.C.R. 381 33
Withler v. Canada (Attorney General) [2011] 1 S.C.R. 396 60

C. Sexual Orientation
Egan v. Canada [1995] 2 S.C.R. 513 68
Vriend v. Alberta [1998] 1 S.C.R. 493 81
M. v. H. [1999] 2 S.C.R. 3.151 98
Note: *Halpern v. Attorney General of Canada* [2003] O.J. No. 2268 113
Reference re Same-Sex Marriage, [2004] 3 S.C.R. 698 114

D. Disability
Eldridge v. British Columbia [1997] 3 S.C.R. 624 129
Auton v. British Columbia [2004] 3 S.C.R. 657 136

E. Analogous Grounds
Note: *Nova Scotia (Attorney General) v. Walsh* 2002 SCC 83 143
Corbiere v. Canada [1999] 2 S.C.R. 203 145

F. Affirmative Action and Positive Discrimination
Note: *Lovelace v. Ontario* [2001] 1 S.C.R. 950 152
R v. Kapp [2008] SCC 41 154

CHAPTER 13: FREEDOM OF ASSOCIATION
Steven Barret, "*Dunmore v. Ontario*: Freedom of Association at the Crossroads" 157
Ken Norman, "Freedom of Association" 175
Dunmore v. Ontario (Attorney General) [2001] 3 S.C.R. 1016 194
Health Services and Support. v. British Columbia [2007] 2 S.C.R. 391 205

CHAPTER 14: MODERN FEDERALISM – READINGS
Ronald Watts, Comparing *Fed'l Systems in the 1990's* 214
Keith S. Rosen, "Federalism in the Americas in Comparative Perspective" 218
Barry Strayer, *The Canadian Constitution and the Courts: The Function and Scope of Judicial Review*, 3 ed 223
Paul Weiler, *In the Last Resort* (Toronto: Carswell, 1974) at 164 ff 226
Garth Stevenson, *Unfulfilled Union: Canadian Federalism and National Unity* at 45ff 227

CHAPTER 15: MODERN FEDERALISM – SELECTED POWERS (CASES)
A. Overview
Canadian Western Bank v. Alberta, 2007 SCC 22, [2007] 2 S.C.R. 3 237
Reference re Employment Insurance Act (Can.), ss. 22 and 23, [2005] 2 S.C.R. 669 240

B. Criminal Law & Property and Civil Rights
Proprietary Articles Trade Association v. Attorney-General for Canada, [1931] 2 D.L.R. 1 259
Re Validity of Section 5(a) of the Dairy Industry Act (The Margarine Reference) [1949] S.C.R. 1 189 260
R. v. Morgentaler, [1993] 3 S.C.R. 463 261
Reference re Firearms Act, [2000] 1 S.C.R. 783 268
R. v. Hydro-Québec, [1997] 3 S.C.R. 213 276
Note: *Chatterjee v. Ontario (Attorney General)*, 2009 SCC 19 281

C. Trade and Commerce & Property and Civil Rights
General Motors v. City National Leasing, [1989] 1 S.C.R. 641 282
Proposal for National Securities Regulator 292

D. Peace, Order, and Good Government (POGG)
Bushnell, "*Reference re Anti-Inflation Act, 1976*" 299
Re: Anti-Inflation Act, [1976] 2 S.C.R. 373 303
R. v. Crown Zellerbach Canada Ltd., [1988] 1 S.C.R. 401 313
Note: *Malmo-Levine*, [2003] 3 S.C.R. 571 319

E. Paramountcy
Multiple Access Ltd. v. McCutcheon, [1982] 2 S.C.R. 161 320
Bank of Montreal v. Hall, [1990] 1 S.C.R. 121 322
Husky Oil Operations Ltd. v. M.N.R., [1995] 3 SCR 453 325
Rothmans, Benson & Hedges Inc. v. Saskatchewan, [2005] 1 S.C.R. 188, 250 D.L.R. (4th) 411 327
Note: *Law Society of British Columbia v. Mangat*, [2001] 3 S.C.R. 113 330

F. Interjurisdictional Immunity
Canadian Western Bank v. Alberta, 2007 SCC 22, [2007] 2 S.C.R. 3 331